# 8

# The *Eihei kōroku*: The Record of Dōgen's Later Period at Eihei-ji Temple

Steven Heine

This chapter examines the textual history, structure, and function of the Eihei koroku (Extensive records of the Eihei-ji first patriarch). This is one of the two main texts produced by Dogen (1200–1253). the founder of the Sōtō Zen sect in thirteenth-century Japan, and the primary work representing the later period of Dogen's career. The later period covered the last decade of his life (1244–1253), when Dogen served as abbot of Eihei-ji temple in the remote Echizen mountains, far removed from the capital and the center of Japanese Buddhism in Kyoto. The Eihei kōroku is a collection of various kinds of verses and sermons, especially formal sermons composed in Chinese (kanbun) that are contained in the first seven of ten volumes. It was compiled by Dogen's disciples according to the model of the "recorded sayings" (yü-lu or kuang-lu; J. goroku or koroku) genre, or collected records of the great Chinese Ch'an masters of the Sung dynasty. The Eihei koroku is probably the first main example of this genre produced in Japan.

After discussing a general overview of the formation of the text and its various sections and subsections, I will examine the historical and theoretical significance of the work by analyzing a number of passages representing different styles and time periods of composition. In particular, I will show the original and innovative approach of Dōgen, who cited from or alluded to a vast repertoire of Chinese Ch'an writings with which he was intimately familiar and which he almost singlehandedly was responsible for introducing to Japan. At the same time, Dōgen critiqued or rewrote numerous Chinese sayings, including those of his mentor during the time of

his pilgrimage to China, Ju-ching (1163–1227), and one of Ju-ching's main predecessors in the Ts'ao-tung (J. Sōtō) sect lineage, Hung-chih (1091–1157).

## Overview: Structure and Function of the Text

Until recently, the *Eihei kōroku* has received far less attention in Dōgen studies than his other main text, the *Shōbōgenzō* (Treasury of the true Dharma-eye).<sup>1</sup> The *Shōbōgenzō*, a collection of informal sermons, is generally considered the first writing on Buddhism in the Japanese vernacular; it was the primary work of Dōgen's earlier period, the ten years (1233–1243) he spent as abbot of Kōshōji temple in the town of Fukakusa on the outskirts of Kyoto. The composition of the *Shōbōgenzō* was almost entirely completed by the time of the move to Echizen (currently Fukui) Province. Therefore, this work does not reveal Dōgen's teachings or training style from the later period, although Dōgen apparently continued to edit some of the *Shōbōgenzō* fascicles. During this period he also composed additional fascicles that are included in a special edition known as the 12-fascicle *Shōbōgenzō*, in contrast to the better known collection from the earlier period known as the 75-fascicle *Shōbōgenzō*.

Some portions of the *Eihei kōroku* were completed prior to the Eihei-ji period, especially the first fascicle, which contains formal sermons delivered at Kōshō-ji temple in Kyoto, the ninth fascicle, which contains verse comments on kōans composed in 1236, and some of the Chinese verses contained in the last volume, which are from his travels to China in the mid-1220s. But the vast majority of material in the other volumes reflects Dōgen's teachings in the role of abbot of Eihei-ji temple.

Both the *Shōbōgenzō* and the *Eihei kōroku* consist primarily of collections of sermons delivered by Dōgen to his assembly of disciples. However, they represent two very different styles of sermonizing, as shown in Table 8.1. The *Shōbōgenzō*, composed in Japanese, contains *jishu*-style or informal sermons

|            | Jōdō                       | Jishu                                 |
|------------|----------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Text       | Eihei kōroku, vols. 1–7    | Shōbōgenzō, up to 95 fascicles        |
| Where      | hattō                      | hōjō                                  |
| When       | day                        | evening                               |
| Style      | formal                     | informal                              |
| Expression | demonstrative              | rhetorical                            |
| Length     | brief and allusive         | extended, with details and citations  |
| Audience   | monks, with general guests | diverse, those requesting instruction |
| Atmosphere | public, communal           | private, individual                   |

TABLE 8.1. The Two Different Styles of Sermons Collected in the *Eihei kōroku* and the *Shōbōgenzō*, respectively

with lengthy discussions of specific doctrines and citations of passages from Mahāyāna sutras in addition to many different examples of Zen kōans. The *jishu* sermons were delivered at different times of the day, as well as late at night, mainly as a special instruction for those who requested or required it in the abbot's quarters ( $h\bar{o}j\bar{o}$ ) or some other setting in the monastic compound. They were often written out prior to delivery, and then recorded and subsequently edited by Dōgen's main disciple, Ejō. Several of these sermons were delivered on more than one occasion or were apparently rewritten and reedited several times over the years.

The *Eihei kōroku*, composed in Chinese, contains records of *jōdō* (C. *shang-t'ang*) style of formal sermons, which were delivered exclusively in the Dharma hall (*hattō*), generally according to a set schedule and at a fixed time of the day, often for a ceremonial or memorial occasion. Although this style is considered formal, the *jōdō* was an oral manner of teaching recorded by disciples that contains many examples of spontaneous gestures and utterances.<sup>2</sup> Like the *Shōbōgenzō*, the *jōdō* sermons often cite kōan cases, and also cite or allude to a multitude of passages from the recorded sayings of Zen masters as well as the transmission of the lamp histories of the various schools that were collected during the time when Zen was the dominant form of Buddhism in Sung China during the eleventh and twelfth centuries. Both texts are therefore characterized by a remarkably extensive intertextuality, in that they achieve a great degree of originality and creativity through the process of citing and commenting on a wide variety of earlier Ch'an/Zen texts.

### Editions

There are two main editions of the *Eihei kōroku* text. One is the 1598 edition attributed to the monk Monkaku, which is generally considered the authentic version that is used in the main modern edition of the collected writings of Dōgen, the *Dōgen zenji zenshū*.<sup>3</sup> There is an edition believed to be older than the Monkaku known as the Sozan edition, but this is undated and not verified. The Sozan edition seems to be almost wholly consistent with the Monkaku edition, so that most scholars feel that it was the model used by Monkaku and they now generally refer to the texts interchangeably. The other edition is the 1672 version edited by Manzan Dōhaku, one of the leaders of the eighteenth-century revival of Sōtō scholarly studies. This is also known as the *rufubon*, or popular edition.

The Monkaku edition is considered questionable, partly because it seems to have been based on a prominent but controversial abbreviated version of the text known as the *Eihei goroku*. The *Eihei goroku* was apparently created in China in the 1260s, about a decade after Dōgen's death, when one of his leading disciples, Giin, went to China to show Dōgen's Dharma brothers samples of the master's works. This makes it the earliest edition of at least some of *Eihei kōroku* material in circulation, but it is not truly representative of the source text.<sup>4</sup>

The *Eihei goroku*, which consists of selections of about 20 percent of the longer text, became one of the most frequently cited works (much more so than either the *Eihei kōroku* or the *Shōbōgenzō*) in the Sōtō sect's scholastic and esoteric, hermeneutic traditions of the medieval Kamakura and Muromachi eras. This tradition produced a body of literature known as *shōmono* writings, with several important subgenres representing different styles and levels of commentary on the original materials. An emphasis on the *Eihei goroku* persisted until there was a renewed interest in studying the original texts of the sect's founder during the Tokugawa era, which was spearheaded by Manzan and one of his main followers, Menzan, among others. During this revival, the *Shōbōgenzō*, as well as the *Eihei kōroku*, started to receive greater attention. This development helped pave the way for modern textual studies, although scholars today, who are also helped considerably by the legacy of Tokugawa-era studies, must struggle to ascertain and overcome the inaccuracies and intrasectarian biases evidenced in some of the seminal Tokugawa editions and commentaries.

Despite numerous and at times significant discrepancies between the Monkaku/Sozan and Manzan/*rufubon* editions, especially in the numbering of the passages, particularly in volume 1, and in the exact wording of numerous passages, particularly in volume 10, the contents of all *Eihei kōroku* editions follow the same basic structure.<sup>5</sup>

- Kōshō-ji goroku (jōdō sermons, no. 1–126, dated 1236–1243, rec. Senne)—two-year hiatus during transition from Fukakusa to Echizen with no Dharma hall
- 2. Daibutsu-ji goroku (nos. 127-84, dated 1245-1246, rec. Ejō)
- 3. Eihei-ji goroku (nos. 185–257, dated 1246–1248, rec. Ejō)
- 4. Eihei-ji goroku (nos. 258–345, dated 1248–1249, rec. Ejō)
- 5. Eihei-ji goroku (nos. 346–413, dated 1249–1251, rec. Gien)
- 6. Eihei-ji goroku (nos. 414–470, dated 1251, rec. Gien)
- 7. Eihei-ji goroku (nos. 471-531, dated 1251-1252, rec. Gien)
- 8. Miscellaneous (20 *shōsan* from Daibutsu-ji/Eihei-ji, 14 *hōgo* from Kōshō-ji, *Fukanzazengi*, rec. Ejō and others)
- 9. *Kōshō-ji* collection (90 kōan cases with *juko* comments from 1236, rec. Senne and others)
- 10. Kanbun poetry collections (5 *shinsan*; 20 *jisan*; 125 *geju*, dated 1223–1253, rec. Senne and others)

A key feature is that the *Eihei kōroku* contains a variety of materials that generally include sermons which often incorporate verse comments or poems that usually have a didactic function. Both the sermons and poetry evoke, allude to, or comment directly on a vast storehouse of Chinese Ch'an kōans and other kinds of records.

#### Sermons

The first seven volumes of the *Eihei kōroku* consist of 531 *jōdō* sermons collected over a fifteen-year period. These begin with the opening of the Dharma hall at Kōshō-ji (1236–1243), as contained in volume 1. But most of the sermons stem from the time of Dōgen's abbacy at Daibutsu-ji/Eihei-ji, as contained in the other six volumes that continued to be collected until 1252, a year before the end of Dōgen's life, when he fell ill and apparently stopped delivering sermons. The other volumes contain a variety of genres that are typical of Zen Buddhist recorded sayings texts. These include two other kinds of informal, vernacular sermons in volume 8, including 20 *shōsan* for smaller meetings from the Kōshō-ji period, and 14 *hōgo* or Dharma discourses from the Eihei-ji period. Both the *shōsan* and *hōgo* styles are somewhat different from the *jishu*-style of the *Shōbōgenzō*. In general, they are less filled with philosophical depth and rhetorical flourish and more concerned with concrete, practical affairs in the life of the monastery. The brief meditation manual, the *Fukanzanzengi*, which was probably composed in 1233, is also included at the end of volume 8.

The ninth volume contains verse commentaries (*juko*) on 90 kōan cases composed in 1236, a year after the compiling of the *Mana Shōbōgenzō* collection of 300 kōans, which is a listing of cases with no commentary. Therefore, volume 9 represents an early attempt by Dōgen to find an appropriate style for providing commentary on kōans. Dōgen's collection of 150 poems in volume 10 were composed in three styles in Chinese script (*kanshi*) and stem from different periods ranging throughout his entire career. The composition of these poems began with Dōgen's travels to China, and the poems are among the only known writings from this very early period. The poetry collection also includes works that range from the period of transition to Echizen, when Dōgen stayed in mountain hermitages for nearly a year, to the later days at Eiheiji as he approached his demise. It is clear that the majority of poems was composed during the Echizen years.

The first seven volumes can be further subdivided in two ways. One way is by the three locations for the sermons, including the Dharma Halls at Kōshōji temple (vol. 1), Daibutsu-ji temple, the original name of Eihei-ji when Dōgen first moved to Echizen in 1244 until it was changed in 1246 (vol. 2), and Eiheiji temple proper (vols. 3–7). The other way of subdividing the text is by the three prominent assistants (*jisha*) to Dōgen who served as recorders or editors of the sermons. These include Senne (recorder of vol. 1, in addition to vols. 9 and 10), the primary early commentator on the *Shōbōgenzō* who remained in Kyoto with his main disciple Kyōgō after Dōgen and the rest of the community left for Echizen in 1243; Ejō (vols. 2–4 and 8), who became the second patriarch of Eihei-ji after Dōgen's death and was the primary editor of the *Shōbōgenzō* fascicles; and Gien (vols. 5–7), a disciple of Ejō who became the fourth Eiheiji patriarch. The transition from Ejō's editorship to Gien's that occurred around the ninth month/first day of 1249 is a significant turning point, according to some scholars, particularly Ishii Shūdō. This is because this period also marked another important shift for Dōgen, who had completed work on the 75-fascicle *Shōbōgenzō* several years before and now began writing and collecting the new collection known as the the 12-fascicle *Shōbōgenzō*. It is particularly notable that there are some basic correspondences between the sermons of the Gien volumes and the 12-fascicle *Shōbōgenzō*, particularly in an emphasis on the doctrines of karmic causality and moral retribution. This seems to mark an important and dramatic intellectual shift or "change" (*henka*) in Dōgen's approach to Buddhist doctrine.<sup>6</sup>

On the one hand, there is a basic consistency of style and content that runs throughout the seven volumes of  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  sermons. For example, as illustrated in Table 8.2, which shows the numbers of all the sermons that can be dated conclusively based on the identifying introductory material contained in the passages themselves, many of the sermons were delivered for ceremonial occasions. These range from Buddhist events, such as memorials for the birth and enlightenment anniversaries of the Buddha, to seasonal and secular festivities. Also, a majority of sermons were based on the citations of kōans and other earlier Zen writings from China, as well as the demonstrative use of staffs and fly whisks as symbols of the master's authority and transcendent power.

There are some basic themes and approaches that are consistently employed throughout the text. These include the frequent use of the imagery of plum blossoms as a symbol of renewal and awakening; an emphasis on the role of the continuous practice of *zazen* as an essential component of the religious quest; the demonstrative use of the Zen staff and fly whisk as indicators of the master's authority; and Dōgen's eagerness to critique the eminent Chinese Ch'an predecessors whose records he frequently cites. For example, *jōdō* no. 2.135, a sermon for the winter solstice at Daibutsu-ji temple that appears near the beginning of volume 2, evokes a combination of these images, symbols, and attitudes in citing and revising a passage from the record of Hung-chih:

When the ancient buddha Hung-chih was residing at Mount T'ient'ung, during a winter solstice sermon he said, "Yin reaches its fullness and yang arises, as their power is exhausted conditions change. A green dragon runs away when his bones are exposed. A black panther looks different when it is covered in mist. Take the skulls of all the buddhas of the triple world, and thread them onto a single rosary. Do not speak of bright heads and dark heads, as truly they are sun face, moon face. Even if your measuring cup is full and the balance scale is level, in transactions I sell at a high price and buy when the price is low. Zen worthies, do you understand this? In a bowl the bright pearl rolls on its own without being pushed.

"Here is a story," [Hung-chih continued].

"Hsüeh-feng asked a monk, 'Where are you going?"

"The monk said, 'I'm going to do my communal labor.'

"Hsüeh-feng said, 'Go ahead.'

"Yün-men said [of this dialogue], 'Hsüeh-feng judges people based on their words.'"

Hung-chih said, "Do not make a move. If you move I'll give you thirty blows. Why is this so? Take a luminous jewel without any flaw, and if you carve a pattern on it its virtue is lost."

The teacher [Dōgen] then said: Although these three venerable ones [Hung-chih, Hsüeh-feng, Yün-men] spoke this way, old man Daibutsu [Dōgen] does not agree. Great assembly, listen carefully and consider this well. For a luminous jewel without flaw, if polished its glow increases....

With his fly-whisk [Dogen] drew a circle and said: Look!

After a pause [Dōgen] said, Although the plum blossoms are colorful in the freshly fallen snow, you must look into it further to understand the first arrival of yang [with the solstice].

Here, Dōgen is indebted to Hung-chih's original passage, which cites Ma-tsu's famous saying, "Sun face [or eternal] buddha, moon face [or temporal] buddha" in *Book of Serenity* (C. *Ts'ung-jung lu*, J. *Shōyōroku*) case 36, and also includes a saying about the bright pearl that appears in the fourth line of Hung-chih's verse comment on this case. But Dōgen challenges all the masters. After making a dramatic, well-timed demonstration with the fly whisk as a symbol of authority, Dōgen then evokes the image of plum blossoms in the snow to highlight the need for continually practicing *zazen* meditation. This reinforces his rewriting of the jewel metaphor to put an emphasis on the process of polishing.

At the same time, there seem to be some key differences in the materials collected by the three recorders of the *Eihei kōroku* sermons. First, in volume I there are numerous short and concise sermons (about 15 percent of the total), which consist of only one or two sentences.<sup>7</sup> For example, no. 1.34 queries simply, "If this greatest cold does not penetrate into our bones, how will the fragrance of the plum blossoms pervade the entire universe?" and no. 1.23 states, "Deeply see the blue mountains constantly walking. By yourself know the white stone woman gives birth to a child at night." Both sermons conclude with a reference to the fact that following the brief verbal utterance "Dōgen descended from his seat."

In the second main section (vols. 2-4, recorded by Ejō), we find that a new pattern emerges, as seen above, in which Dōgen cites eminent predecessors

| YEAR  | 1/1<br>New<br>Year | 1/10<br>10th<br>Day | 1/15<br>Full<br>Moon | 2/15<br>Buddha<br>Death | 3/1<br>Open<br>Hearth | 3/14<br>Return<br>Kamakura | 3/20<br>20th<br>Day | 4/8<br>Buddha<br>Birth | 4/15<br>Summer<br>Retreat | 4/25<br>25th<br>Day | 5/1<br>New<br>Moon | 5/5<br>Boys'<br>Fest | 5/27<br>Memor<br>Butsujuª | 6/1<br>New<br>Moon | 6/10<br>10th<br>Day | 6/10<br>Emperor<br>Birthday | 6/15<br>Temple<br>Name <sup>b</sup> |
|-------|--------------------|---------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------|--------------------|----------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 1236  | Х                  | Х                   | Х                    | Х                       | Х                     | Х                          | Х                   | Х                      | Х                         | Х                   | Х                  | Х                    | Х                         | Х                  | Х                   | Х                           | Х                                   |
| 1240  |                    |                     |                      |                         |                       |                            |                     |                        |                           |                     |                    |                      |                           |                    |                     |                             |                                     |
| 1241  | 32                 |                     |                      |                         |                       |                            |                     | 42                     | 44                        |                     |                    |                      |                           |                    |                     |                             |                                     |
| 1242  | 90h                |                     |                      |                         |                       |                            |                     | 98                     |                           |                     |                    |                      |                           |                    |                     |                             |                                     |
| 1243  | 116                |                     |                      | 121                     | 122                   |                            |                     | 75                     | 118                       |                     |                    |                      |                           |                    |                     |                             |                                     |
| 1244  | Х                  | Х                   | Х                    | Х                       | Х                     | Х                          | Х                   | Х                      | Х                         | Х                   | Х                  | Х                    | Х                         | Х                  | Х                   | Х                           | Х                                   |
| 1245  | Х                  | Х                   | Х                    | Х                       | Х                     | Х                          | Х                   | Х                      | 127                       |                     |                    |                      |                           |                    |                     |                             |                                     |
| 1246  | 142H               |                     |                      | 146                     |                       |                            | 152h                | 155h                   | 158h                      |                     |                    | 169                  | 171                       |                    |                     |                             | 177                                 |
| 1247  | 216H               |                     | 219                  | 225                     |                       |                            |                     | 236H                   | 238                       |                     |                    | 242H                 |                           |                    | 247                 |                             |                                     |
| 1248  | Х                  | Х                   | Х                    | Х                       | Х                     | 251                        |                     | 256H                   | 257H                      | 259                 | 261H               |                      |                           |                    |                     |                             |                                     |
| 1249  | 303H               | 305                 |                      | 311                     |                       |                            |                     | 320H                   | 322H                      | 324                 | 325                | 326H                 |                           |                    |                     |                             |                                     |
| 1250  |                    |                     |                      | 367                     |                       |                            |                     |                        |                           |                     |                    |                      |                           |                    |                     | 379                         |                                     |
| 1251  |                    |                     | 412                  | 418                     |                       |                            |                     | 427                    |                           |                     |                    |                      | 435                       |                    |                     |                             |                                     |
| 1252  |                    |                     | 481                  | 486                     | 489                   |                            |                     | 495                    |                           |                     |                    |                      | 504                       | 505                |                     |                             |                                     |
| Total | 6                  | 1                   | 3                    | 7                       | 2                     | 1                          | 1                   | 9                      | 7                         | 2                   | 1                  | 4                    | 2                         | 1                  | 1                   | 1                           | 1                                   |

TABLE 8.2. Chronology of Eihei Koroku Construction

| YEAR  | 7/5<br>Memor.<br>Eisai <sup>c</sup> | 7/15<br>Close<br>Retreat | 7/17<br>Memor.<br>Ju-ching |     |     | 8/6<br>Ju-ching<br>Record |      |     | 9/2<br>Memor.<br>Minamoto | 10/1<br>Open <sup>d</sup><br>Temple | 10/15<br>Open<br>Hearth | 11 mo.<br>Winter<br>Solstice |     | Tenth | 12 mo.<br>Memor.<br>Mother | Year | Total          |
|-------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------------|-----|-----|---------------------------|------|-----|---------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------|-----|-------|----------------------------|------|----------------|
| 1236  | Х                                   | Х                        | Х                          | Х   | Х   | Х                         | Х    | Х   | Х                         | (1)                                 | Х                       | Х                            | Х   | Х     | Х                          | Х    |                |
| 1240  |                                     |                          |                            |     |     |                           | 13H  |     |                           |                                     | 14H                     | 25                           |     |       |                            |      | 1 - 31 = 31    |
| 1241  |                                     |                          |                            |     |     |                           | 77H  |     |                           |                                     |                         |                              | 88  |       |                            |      | 32-65          |
|       |                                     |                          |                            |     |     |                           |      |     |                           |                                     |                         |                              |     |       |                            |      | 76-89 = 48     |
| 1242  |                                     | 102                      |                            | 104 |     | 105                       | 106  |     |                           |                                     | 109                     | 115                          |     |       |                            |      | 90-115 = 26    |
| 1243  |                                     |                          | Х                          | Х   | Х   | Х                         | Х    | Х   | Х                         | Х                                   | Х                       | Х                            | Х   | Х     | Х                          | Х    | 66-75          |
|       |                                     |                          |                            |     |     |                           |      |     |                           |                                     |                         |                              |     |       |                            |      | 116-126 = 21   |
| 1244  | Х                                   | Х                        | Х                          | Х   | Х   | Х                         | Х    | Х   | Х                         | Х                                   | Х                       | Х                            | Х   | Х     | Х                          | Х    | 0              |
| 1245  |                                     | 130                      |                            |     |     |                           |      |     |                           |                                     |                         | 135H                         | 136 |       |                            |      | 127 - 141 = 15 |
| 1246  |                                     | 183h                     | 184                        |     |     |                           | 189  | 193 |                           |                                     | 199                     | 206H                         | 213 |       |                            |      | 142 - 215 = 74 |
| 1247  |                                     | 248                      | 249                        |     | 250 | Х                         | Х    | Х   | Х                         | Х                                   | Х                       | Х                            | Х   | Х     | Х                          | Х    | 216-250 = 35   |
| 1248  |                                     |                          | 274                        |     |     |                           | 277  | 279 |                           |                                     | 288                     | 296H                         | 297 |       |                            | 302  | 251-275        |
|       |                                     |                          |                            |     |     |                           |      |     |                           |                                     |                         |                              |     |       |                            |      | 277 - 302 = 51 |
| 1249  |                                     | 341                      | 342                        |     |     |                           | 344H | 347 |                           |                                     | 353                     |                              | 360 |       |                            |      | 303-345        |
|       |                                     |                          |                            |     |     |                           |      |     |                           |                                     |                         |                              |     |       |                            |      | 346 - 360 = 58 |
| 1250  |                                     |                          | 384                        |     |     |                           | 413  | 389 | 363                       |                                     | 396                     |                              | 406 | 392   | 409                        |      | 361-411        |
|       |                                     |                          |                            |     |     |                           |      |     |                           |                                     |                         |                              |     |       |                            |      | 413 = 52       |
| 1251  | 441                                 | 442                      | 276                        |     |     |                           | 448  | 451 |                           |                                     | 462                     |                              | 475 |       | 478                        |      | 276, 412       |
|       |                                     |                          |                            |     |     |                           |      |     |                           |                                     |                         |                              |     |       |                            |      | 414 - 480 = 69 |
| 1252  | 512                                 | 514h                     | 515                        |     |     |                           | 521  | 523 | 524                       |                                     | 528                     |                              | 506 |       |                            |      | 481-531 = 51   |
| TOTAL | 2                                   | 7                        | 7                          | 1   | 1   | 1                         | 9    | 6   | 2                         |                                     | 8                       | 5                            | 8   | 1     | 2                          | 1    | 531            |

H = direct influence of Hung-chih, h = indirect influence

LINE = beginning of Gien's editing of the EK, and Dögen's focus on the composition of the 12-fascicle Shöbögenzö.

<sup>a</sup>1184–1221, disciple of Eisai and teacher of Dōgen.

<sup>b</sup>Change name from Daibutsu-ji to Eihei-ji.

°1141–1225, a.k.a. Myōan Senkō.

"The opening of Kōshōji Temple in 1236 was marked by record in the Manzan edition only.

of Chinese Ch'an but also is willing to challenge, critique, revise, and rewrite their sayings to express his own unique understanding and appropriation of Buddhist teaching. For example, in no. 3.207 Dōgen criticizes Yün-men, as well as the whole notion of the autonomy of a "Zen school" (*Zen-shū*) that may take priority over the universal Buddha Dharma.

[Dōgen] said: Practitioners of Zen should know wrong from right. It is said that after [the ancestor] Upagupta, there were five sects of Buddha Dharma during its decline in India. After Ch'ing-yüan and Nan-yüeh, people took it upon themselves to establish the various styles of the five houses, which was an error made in China. Moreover, in the time of the ancient buddhas and founding ancestors, it was never possible to see or hear the Buddha Dharma designated as the "Zen school," which has never actually existed. What is presently called the Zen school is not truly the Buddha Dharma.

I remember that a monk once asked Yün-men, "I heard that an ancient said that although the [patriarch of the Ox Head school] expounded horizontally and vertically, he did not know the key to the workings of going beyond. What is that key to the workings of going beyond?"

Yün-men said, "The eastern mountain and the western peak are green."

If someone were to ask Eihei [Dōgen], "What is that key to the workings of going beyond?" I would simply reply to him, "Indra's nose is three feet long."

Note the way Dōgen rewrites Yün-men's response. Neither expression addresses the question directly, and it could be argued that each has its merits as a manifestation of Zen wisdom. Yet Dōgen seems to suggest that Yün-men's phrasing is deficient and that his own saying is on the mark, perhaps because it is at once more indirect and absurd yet more concrete and down-to-earth.

The third section of  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  sermons (vols. 5–7, recorded by Gien) is characterized by numerous very lengthy passages, many of which stress the doctrine of karmic causality and moral retribution experienced throughout the three tenses of time, often by citing the texts of pre-Mahāyāna Buddhism, as in  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$ nos. 5.381, 6.437, 7.485, and 7.517. For example, no. 6.437 from 1251 makes it clear that those who advocate the inescapable efficacy of karmic retribution alone are the true Buddhists, whereas those who reject this doctrine in favor of a metaphysical principle beyond morality and considered free from karma must be considered heretics. The passages have a close affinity with the "Jinshin inga" and "Sanjigo" fascicles of the 12-fascicle *Shōbōgenzō*, which were also composed in the early 1250s. They stress the significance of causality as crucial for appropriating the Buddha Dharma and severely criticize those who dismiss or ignore this outlook. At the same time, there are passages in this section of sermons that reflect an emphasis on supernaturalism, which is also in accord with some elements in the 12-fascicle  $Sh\bar{o}b\bar{o}genz\bar{o}$ . For example,  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$ no. 5.388 tells a story of repentance involving demons and celestial spirits.

The differences between the three sections of the *jōdō* sermons may reflect an evolution or transition in Dōgen's own approach and attitudes. Or, they may be based on the diverging skills and perspectives of the recorders, although it is impossible to determine how much input the editors may have actually had in the formation of the text. In any case, it is crucial to see that Dōgen's style and approach were by no means static, but shifted significantly throughout the periods during which the records were collected.

#### Historical and Theoretical Levels of Significance

The levels of significance of the various kinds of records collected in the *Eihei*  $k\bar{o}roku$  encompass diverse aspects. There is a historical dimension, which includes the importance of monastic rituals as well as issues in Dōgen's biography, such as his changing attitudes toward the development of Zen in China and Japan. There is also a theoretical dimension, which includes Dōgen's use of diverse literary styles and citations of Zen and other kinds of Buddhist texts, in addition to his approach to various doctrines in Chinese and Japanese Buddhism.

#### Monastic Routine

The passages in this category reveal the role of liturgy and ritual in Dogen's approach to Zen monasticism, especially in the main sermons that were delivered in a rather mechanical fashion for ceremonial occasions and memorials, although they still often express a sense of spontaneity, especially through the use of verse commentary or demonstrative gestures near the conclusion of the discourse. According to the pattern prescribed in the Ch'an-yüan ching-kuei (J. Zen'en shingi) of 1103, the seminal text containing Chinese Ch'an monastic rules, the *jodo* sermons were to be delivered at least five or six times a month, on the first, fifth, tenth, fifteenth, twentieth, and twenty-fifth days of the month, in addition to other special occasions.8 Dogen apparently adjusted the prescribed schedule that was implemented in China to fit the needs of his development of Zen monasticism at Eihei-ji temple in Japan. Based on the numbers of sermons in Table 8.2 it is clear that the Buddha's birth (4/8), death (2/15), and enlightenment (12/8) anniversaries, in addition to memorials for his Japanese teacher Eisai and Chinese mentor Juching, were favorite events in the yearly cycle. Dogen also consistently presented sermons for seasonal celebrations, especially in the fall (new and full moons in the eighth, ninth, and tenth months).

A prime example of a ceremonial sermon is  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  no. 1.90, delivered on New Year's day in 1242 at Kōshō-ji temple, which concludes with a seasonal verse on blossoms blooming in spring as a symbol of renewal and personal awakening.

As the heavenly sky is clear, each and every thing purifies each and every other thing. The earth is covered with nourishing moisture, penetrating a thousand things and soaking ten thousand things. How is it at such a time as this?

After a pause [Dōgen] said:

The harmonious expression of spring makes the whole world fragrant, The deity of spring sits impassively in the Cloud [monks'] hall,

On every branch their flowers blooming of coral color,

The opening of blossoms throughout the world open makes this is a celestial realm.

Similarly,  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  no. 4.297, a sermon delivered in 1248 for the Buddha's Enlightenment Day (traditionally celebrated in Japan on 12/8), evokes the image of plum blossoms, which are beginning to come to the fruition of their growth cycle even when they are still far from visible in the midst of the winter snow, that starts with an exclamation cited from the verse comment to a story about Layman Pang playing in the snow in the *Blue Cliff Record* (C. *Pi-yen lu*, J. *Hekiganroku*), case 42.

The snowball hits! The snowball hits! It hits as the cold plum blossoms in the snow. On this eighth day of the twelfth month, the bright star in heaven and a wooden ladle on the earth appear before the spring.

In many of the ceremonial sermons, Dōgen cites through either praise or criticism—or some playful, ironic combination—the teachings of his predecessors in Sung Chinese Ch'an, especially Ju-ching and Hung-chih. In  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  no. 3.249, Dōgen uses a memorial for the anniversary of Ju-ching's death as an opportunity to eulogize the master's transcendence of secularism and corruption.

Today Ju-ching frolics among the spirits and fans the clouds with the traditions of buddhas and patriarchs. He is resented by the crowds of the corrupt secular world, whose ignorant karmic consciousness continues to affect future generations.

No. 2.184 was delivered on a memorial day for Ju-ching in a different year, when Dōgen said, "When I entered China I studied walking to be like someone from Handan.<sup>9</sup> I worked very hard carrying water and hauling firewood. Don't say that my late teacher deceived his disciple. Rather, T'ien-t'ung Ju-ching was

deceived by Dōgen." In no. 2.167 Dōgen continues the self-deprecating tone by saying, "I would simply say, I cannot avoid deceiving my late teacher." There are many other examples, some of which will be discussed in following sections, in which Dōgen eulogizes his teacher.<sup>10</sup> There are examples, however, such as no. 2.179, also cited below, in which Dōgen criticizes Ju-ching along with other Chinese Ch'an predecessors. Furthermore, in no. 5.390, Dōgen revises Ju-ching's view of meditation, and also criticizes and revises Pai-chang's view of monastic regulations in Zen.

Dōgen attitude toward Hung-chih is particularly interesting in that he seems to rely heavily on the Chinese master's recorded sayings as a model for some of his ceremonial sermons, and yet in citing Hung-chih he rarely loses the opportunity to critique or one-up him, as he also does in the *Shōbōgenzō* "Zazenshin" fascicle. For example, in  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  no. 3.236 for "Bathing [the baby] Buddha," a celebration of the Buddha's birthday in 1247, Dōgen tells that when Hung-chih was abbot at Mount T'ien-t'ung, in a sermon delivered on the same occasion, he had cited an anecdote in which Yün-men performed the bathing ritual and had apologized to the Buddha for using "impure water." However, Dōgen criticizes Hung-chih's interpretation by suggesting:

Although the ancient buddha Hung-chih said it like this, how should Eihei speak of the true meaning of the Buddha's birthday? Casting off the body within the ten thousand forms, the conditions for his birth naturally arose. In a single form after manifesting as a human body, he discovered anew the path to enlightenment. What is the true meaning of our bathing the Buddha?

After a pause [Dōgen] said, Holding in our own hands the broken wooden ladle, we pour water on his head to bathe the body of the Tathāgata.

It is notable that according to Table 8.2 Dōgen cited Hung-chih three or four times on the occasion of the Buddha's birthday between 1246 and 1249, and also on other occasions such as New Years during these years, the beginning of the summer retreat, the Boys' Festival, and the winter solstice, often employing the same strategy of combining citation with criticism. These passages are from the section of the *Eihei kōroku jōdō* sermons edited by Ejō, and this trend of a reliance on the Hung-chih text for the most part did not continue in the later sections edited by Gien.

# Dōgen's Life and Attitudes

The passages in this category focus on biographical and historical issues reflecting or surrounding events in the life of Dōgen and how his attitudes toward key people, texts, and ideas developed and in some cases may have changed markedly during the course of his teaching career. The passages in the *Eihei*  *kōroku* are particularly notable for revealing key features and facts of Dōgen's life about which little else is known and for which there are few, if any, available sources. Some of the events revealed in the *Eihei kōroku* include Dōgen's pilgrimage to China and his relation to Ju-ching and Ch'an Buddhist teaching styles; his life at Kōshō-ji temple and his move to Echizen and establishment of Eihei-ji; and his return from a trip to visit the new shogun, Hōjō Tokiyori, in Kamakura in 1247–1248.

Dōgen's poems in *kanbun* contained in volume 10 are one of the main sources of information about his trip to China. For example, verse 10.32c shows that as part of his practice he visited a pious layman, who was mourning the death of his son. He tried to comfort the bereaved father; this is an interesting function of Ch'an monks in relation to mainstream society:

> When he opens his true eyes, the pupils are clear; Looking at his face, he seems steady, Tears having already been shed, Though his son has entered the realm of the dead. Lord Yama! You won't catch him crying.

Apparently Dōgen also participated in several "verse contests," during which Ju-ching challenged his disciples to change and revise his own poem on a particular topic, such as the harvest moon or a Buddhist symbol. Verse 9.58 is a rewriting of Ju-ching's verse on the symbolism of the ringing of the Bud-dhist bell that Dōgen also cites in *Hōkyōki* and the *Shōbōgenzō* fascicles "Makahannyaharamitsu" and "Kokū." According to Ju-ching's original poem:

The bell looks like a mouth, gaping, Indifferent to the wind blowing in the four directions; If you ask it about the meaning of wisdom, It only answers with a jingling, tinkling sound.

Dōgen's verse uses tautology and onomatopoeia to make the conclusion more concrete and practical:

The bell is a voice articulating emptiness, Playing host to the wind blowing in the four directions, Expressing in its own elegantly crafted language The tintinnabulation: the ringing of the ringing . . .

Whereas the verses show some aspects of what Dōgen was doing and thinking in China, there are numerous  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  sermons that reveal his approach to inheriting and transmitting the teachings to Japan. For example, in no. 1.48, which appears as 1.1 in the Manzan edition (and is also the first sermon in the *Eihei goroku*), Dōgen reflects on Ju-ching in the self-deprecating language he

uses elsewhere, and also offers a couple of brief yet frequently noted verses that highlight the teaching that he brought back from China:

[Dōgen] said, This mountain monk [Dōgen] has not passed through many monasteries. Somehow I just met my late teacher Ju-ching. However, I was not deceived by T'ien-t'ung. But T'ien-t'ung was deceived by this mountain monk. Recently, I returned to my homeland "empty handed" (*kūshū genkyō*). And so this mountain monk has no Buddha Dharma. Trusting fate, I just spend my time.

> Every morning, the sun rises in the east. Every evening, the moon sets in the west, Clouds gathering over the foggy peaks, Rain passes through the surrounding hills and plains. [Also:] A leap year comes every fourth year, A rooster crows at dawn.

*Jōdō* no. 1.105 is notable because it indicates that text of the recorded sayings of Dōgen's mentor, the *Ju-ching yü-lu* (*J. Nyojō goroku*), was delivered to Japan in 1242, and this marked a renewed interest in citing Ju-ching's works, as evidenced by numerous *Shōbōgenzō* fascicles from this period dealing with Ju-ching. No. 2.128, which appears at the beginning of volume 2, is particularly significant for the insight it offers into Dōgen's view of Ju-ching's role in Zen monastic life, particularly regarding the delivery of sermons at evening meetings (*bansan*), as well as Dōgen's general approach to language and the meaning of "words and phrases" in Zen discourse. According to Dōgen, the merit of a monastery is not found in the size of the congregation, for having one great sage as a master is sufficient. Dōgen points out that eminent masters such as Fen-yang, Chao-chou, and Yao-shan had only a relative handful of followers.

Rather, the key to the master's ability to lead and instruct is the evening sermons, which are meant to be spontaneous and intense spiritual experiences. Dōgen asserts that contemporary abbots did not have the ability demonstrated by the early T'ang patriarchs to deliver compelling sermons, and that is why the practice of evening meetings died out. As in many other passages in his writings, Dōgen is highly critical of the practice of the Ch'an school in China, and in no. 4.301 he says, "Throughout the entire world, there is nobody who understands Buddha Dharma," and he agrees with Huang-po that practitioners "are just gobblers of dregs." This saying is a paraphrase of Huang-po's comment recorded in *Blue Cliff Record* case 11 and *Book of Serenity* case 53.

The one main exception is Ju-ching, the kind of leader who only appears "once in a thousand years." In no. 2.128, an evening sermon, which echoes

what is said about Ju-ching in *Shōbōgenzō* "Shohō jissō," Dōgen describes the excitement that is so unusual in his teacher's approach:

Regardless of what the regulations in monastic rules manuals actually prescribed, at midnight, during the early evenings, or at any time after the noonday meal, generally without regard to the time, Ju-ching either had someone beat the drum for entering the abbot's quarters (*nyūshitsu*) to give a general talk (*fusetsu*) or he had someone beat the drum for small meetings (*shūsan*) and then for entering the abbot's quarters. Or sometimes he himself hit the wooden clapper in the Monks hall three times and gave a general talk in the Illuminated hall. After the general talk the monks entered the abbot's quarters. Sometimes he hit the hanging wooden block in front of the head monk's quarters, and gave a general talk in the head monk's room. Again, following the general talk the monks entered the abbot's quarters.

These were extraordinary, truly exceptional experiences! Because Daibustu [Dōgen] is a disciple of Ju-ching, I am also conducting evening meetings, which is happening for the very first time in our country.<sup>11</sup>

Also, in the same sermon, Dōgen expresses his own view of the role of language in relation to silence in Zen discourse. He mentions Tan-hsia (Hungchih's teacher), who once reported that Te-shan said, "There are no words and phrases (*goku*) in my school," but Tan-hsia said, "In my school, there are words and phrases." Dōgen adds, "I would not have spoken like this. Great assembly, do you want to hear what I have to say. In my school *there are only words and phrases* (*yui-goku*)" [emphasis added].

Numerous passages in the *Eihei kōroku* are important because they show some key features of Dōgen's monastic leadership, once he was finally established in Japan. For example,  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  no. 1.41 indicates that there were thirty-one followers at Kōshō-ji temple, and several of the *hōgo* sermons, especially nos. 8.2h and 8.3h, reveal something about the disciples Dōgen taught there, which included nuns as well as Confucianists, and the ways he instructed them, including the use of kōans. The preface to volume 2 indicates that Dōgen moved to the mountain in Echizen on 7/18 of 1244, and that in the following year, "many disciples from the four directions flocked like clouds to practice with him." No. 2.177 concerns the renaming of the temple on 6/15 in 1246, and after that Dōgen referred to himself as "Eihei" (rather than Daibutsu).

One of the most important  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  sermons is no. 3.251, delivered on 3/15 in 1248 upon Dōgen's return to Eihei-ji after spending eight months in Kamakura at the behest of the shogun. Apparently disturbed by the emergence of "Warrior Zen" in evidence in the temporary capital, Dōgen declined the offer to lead a temple that was being built in Kamakura and went home with a new emphasis

on the doctrine of karmic causality as well as a greater appreciation for his monk disciples. Yet it is not clear that Dōgen's effort to reassure his worried followers was fully successful:

[Dōgen] said, On the third day of the eighth month of last year, this mountain monk departed from this mountain and went to the Kamakura District of Sagami Prefecture to expound the Dharma for patrons and lay disciples. In the third month of this year, just last night, I came home to this temple, and this morning I have ascended this seat. Some people may be wondering about the reasons for my travels. After crossing over many mountains and rivers, I did expound the Dharma for the sake of lay students, which may sound like I value worldly people and take monks lightly.

Moreover, some may ask whether I presented some Dharma that I never before expounded, and that they have not heard. However, I did not preach a Dharma there that was different from what I have previously expounded to you here. I merely explained to them that people who do good for others and renounce all evil action will reap the rewards of cause-and-effect. So cast away tiles and pick up jewels. This is the one matter I, Eihei, clarify, explain, believe, and practice. Followers, you must learn this truth!

After a pause, [Dōgen] said, You may laugh to hear my tongue speaking of causality so casually. How many follies I have committed in my effort to cultivate the way. Today it is pitiful that I have become a water buffalo. This is the phrase for expounding Dharma. How shall I utter a phrase for returning home to the mountains? This mountain monk has been gone for more than half a year. I was like a solitary wheel placed in vast space. Today, I have returned to the mountains, and the clouds [that is, monks] are feeling joyful. My great love for this mountain is greater than it has ever been.

In addition to his reaction to the quality of Zen in Kamakura, another major turning point in Dōgen's later career was the reception of a complete copy of the *Tripitaka* (J. *Agonkyō*) at Eihei-ji near the end of 1249 from his patron, Hatano Yoshishige. This is commemorated in no. 5.361, which acknowledges the receipt, no. 5.362, which gives thanks, and no. 5.366, which describes the embroidered cover that was made for the texts. Once he had the *Tripitaka* in his possession, Dōgen then began to focus on drawing his citations from early Buddhist texts rather than strictly from the Zen canon. This tendency reinforced the emphasis on the basic doctrine of karmic causality and retribution, which seemed to begin with no. 3.251 and was also expressed extensively in the 12-fascicle *Shōbōgenzō* composed during this period of Dōgen's career.

There were other doctrines emphasized by Dogen in the later, post-

Kamakura period, which will be discussed below. At the same time, Dogen seemed to be influenced by another approach to the issues of karma, retribution, and penance, that is, the supernatural early Buddhist jātaka tales that were often translated or integrated into East Asian morality tale literature (setsuwa bungaku). Jōdō no. 5.379, for example, delivered on 6/10 in 1250, deals with the use of a master's supranormal spiritual power in fertility rites. Dogen states that his intention is to invoke a clear sky, and says that "last year rain fell ceaselessly but now I wish for clear weather like my master at Mount Ching-liang Temple [a temple where Ju-ching was abbot before serving at Mount T'ien-t'ung], who went to the Dharma hall to wish for fine weather. When he did not go to the Dharma hall, the buddhas and patriarchs did not either. Today I am in the Dharma hall, just like my former teacher." Yet, Dōgen concludes with an ironic, iconoclastic commentary by pausing, sneezing, and saying "Once I sneeze, clouds break, and the sun appears." Then, he raised the fly whisk, saying, "Monks! Look at this. The cloudless sky swallows the eight directions."

# Literary and Rhetorical Significance

This category covers two main topics, one with an internal significance, and the other with an external reference. The internal level includes passages that demonstrate the way that Dōgen uses a variety of prose and poetic literary styles in the sermons and other records. His heavy reliance on verse is such that even his prose sermons often reflect a sense of rhyme and rhythm. The external reference involves the high degree of intertextuality in Dōgen's selection and citation of earlier Zen texts, especially the records of Hung-chih, the single main patriarch who influenced his approach to delivering *jōdō* sermons.

Several examples of poetry used as a kind of commentary on the main part of the sermon have been discussed above, including 1.42 and 1.48. Another example of a verse providing lyrical commentary in the first seven volumes includes no. 4.279, delivered on 9/1 in 1248, traditionally a day when the relaxed post-*ango* retreat summer period gave way to more intensive training:

Sit on your cushions and think beyond thinking; play vividly and energetically, and don't be fooled by any demonic spirits. The old monk abiding on this mountain swallows buddhas and living beings with one gulp. The crouching lion catches rabbits and enraged elephants with one swipe of his paw. Smashing the polished tile of trying to become a buddha by sitting as a buddha, laugh and destroy the net of doubts of the three vehicles and five vehicles.

> After a pause [Dōgen] said, The opening of the petals plum blossoms, Heralds the beginning of spring.

In the sky at dawn, There is only the round, full moon.

Another example is no. 4.327, on how buddhas transmit their teaching without attachment:

In the dead of the night. The moon low in the sky, As Śākyamuni enters *parinirvāṇa*, The jade forest, turning white, Cannot play host to A thousand-year-old crane, Whose glistening feathers Fly right by the empty nest.

At the same time, several examples contained in the poetry collection in volume 10 are notable for their philosophical significance. For example, no. 10.10b, which accompanies a portrait of Dōgen painted at Kōshō-ji temple, makes an interesting statement on the issue of illusion and reality:

If you take this portrait of me to be real, Then what am I, really? But why hang it there, If not to anticipate people getting to know me? Looking at this portrait, Can you say that what is hanging there Is really me? In that case your mind will never be Fully united with the wall [as in Bodhidharma's wall-gazing meditation].

Similarly, 10.63c deals with the paradoxical sayings of Ma-tsu, who early in his career taught that "Mind Itself Is Buddha" (*sokushin zebustsu*), but later changed to the opposite view, "No mind, no Buddha" (*hishin hibutsu*).

"Mind itself is buddha"—difficult to practice, but easy to explain; "No mind, no buddha"—difficult to explain, but easy to practice.

Another aspect of the internal literary significance is the way that even the prose sections of the  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  sermons integrate poetry as well as other lyrical and literary elements by orchestrating a variety of subgenres to establish patterns of rhythm and rhyme. For example, Andō Yoshinori provides an innovative analysis of several  $j\bar{o}d\bar{o}$  sermons, which could easily be read merely as straightforward prose narratives but actually consist of multiple prose and poetic sections. Both examples cited below culminate in the linguistic device of the "turning word" (*ittengo*) which is used in numerous kōan collections and recorded

sayings texts as an expression of the power of brief, allusive words used as an indirect communication to transform the mind.

The first example, no. 1.68, opens with a formal comment, and the remaining prose and verse passages can be seen as further commentary on this.<sup>12</sup>

When we exhaust our strength to express it,Even half a word is like a pillar holding us up,Training the mind and confirming enlightenment,We use a wooden ladle to scoop up a mouthful.Formal comment

For a person with the ability to hear and with the ability to practice-

Before emotions are born And forms have appeared. Short verse All voices resounding, Each and every thing clearly revealed. Short verse Without awakening, Advancing each step we stumble over our feet, Making seven or eight mistakes. Not yet resting, Taking a step backward we stumble over our exposed legs, Arriving here and arriving there. Low Comment Jumping up and kicking over Mount Sumeru, Raising it up and placing it within everyone's eyeballs. Stumbling and overturning the great ocean, Pick it up and place it within everyone's nostrils. High Comment Why does everyone not awaken and not understand? Mediation After a pause: Last night a flower blossomed and the world became fragrant, This morning a fruit ripened and bodhi matured. Turning Word

The next example, no. 3.243, opens with a dialogue (*mondo*) on the differences between Mahāyāna and Hinayāna teachings, which followed with indirect commentary highlighting natural imagery that emphasizes nonattachment:

Someone asked, "What is Buddha?"

Dōgen replied, "In the end, future births will no longer be necessarily based on the attainment of a special kind of cessation that is not caused by analysis [but rather by original nature—*Abhidharmakośa*].

The monk said, "Master, don't instruct people by referring to the Dharma of the Lesser Vehicle."

Dōgen said, "I am not teaching people using the Dharma of the Lesser Vehicle."

The monk asked again, "What is Buddha?"

Dōgen said, "In the end, future births will no longer be neces-

sary based on the attainment of a special kind of cessation that is not caused by analysis." Dialogue

| Then Dōgen said,  |           |
|---|-----------|
| Heaven is not high,   |           |
| The earth is not dense.                                       | v Comment |
| Mountains, and rivers, and the sun and moon, are not obstruct | cted,     |
| The radiant light of each and every place penetrates          |           |
| each and every other place.                                   | Response  |
| A Persian riding on a white elephant enters the Buddha hall,  |           |
| People from Handan with bare feet circumambulate              |           |
| the Monks hall.   | Response  |
| What kind of principle can we hold on to?                     | Mediation |

After a pause Dōgen said: The bright moon follows someone as if there were a reason. White clouds provide rain, originally with no mind. *Turning Word* 

Another key aspect of the literary significance of the *Eihei kōroku* is intertextuality in terms of the remarkably extensive citations of kōans as well as citations and allusions from other genres of texts dealing with Zen masters. The following list shows the main transmission of the lamp and recorded sayings texts cited by Dōgen.<sup>13</sup>

#### SOURCES CITED IN THE EIHEI KOROKU

| TEXT                            | NO. OF CITATIONS |
|---------------------------------|------------------|
| 1. Ching-te ch'uan-teng lu      | 68               |
| 2. Hung-chih lu                 | 43               |
| 3. Tsung-men t'ung-yao chi      | 25               |
| 4. Tsung-men lien-t'ung hui-yao | 24               |
| 5. Ju-ching lu                  | IO               |
| 6. Chia-t'ai p'u-teng lu        | 7                |
| 7. Yüan-wu lu/sung-ku           | 9                |
| 8. T'ien-sheng kuang-teng lu    | 9                |
| 9. Ta-hui lu                    | 2                |
| 10. Huang-po lu                 | 2                |
| 11. Hsü ch'uan-teng lu          | 2                |
| TOTAL                           | 211              |

The single main Ch'an master from China who influenced Dōgen's text is Hung-chih, who is cited forty-three times, with the majority of these stemming from the period of sermons edited by Ejō, when Dōgen was first in Echizen and establishing Eihei-ji temple. The following is a list of *Eihei kōroku* passages that are based on Hung-chih citations: No. 1.6, 10, 20, 21, 23, 77, 90 No. 2.135, 142, 152, 155, 158, 180, 183 No. 3.186, 187, 203, 206, 216, 220, 222, 223, 226, 227, 236, 242, 246, 256, 257 No. 4.261, 266, 269, 296, 303, 330, 320, 322, 326, 341, 344 No. 5.400, 403 No. 7.514

# Doctrinal Themes

Many *Eihei kõroku* passages are notable for expressing various specific key doctrines that are also addressed in *Shōbōgenzō* fascicles, especially in volumes 1 and 9, as well as more general doctrines concerning Zen practice, especially in volumes 2–4, and also doctrines that are characteristic of the late Dōgen's view of causality and antisyncretism, as in volumes 5–7. Throughout the text there is a consistent emphasis on *zazen* training and the attainment of the crucial enlightenment experience of the casting off of body-mind (*shinjin datsuraku*). Despite apparent variations in substance accompanied by shifts in the style of preaching, it seems that Dōgen never wavered from the core principles of his approach to religious practice.

Some of the doctrines dealt with extensively in *Shōbōgenzō* fascicles also are treated more briefly or elliptically in *jōdō* sermons include "Zenki" (no. 1.52), "Genjōkōan" (1.51), "Immo" (1.38), "Kattō" (1.46), "Ikkya myōjū" (1.107), "Kūge" (2.162), "Ōsakusendaba" (3.254), and "Udonge" (4.308). No. 3.205 comments ironically on the "Pai-chang and the wild fox" kōan that is the main theme of the "Daishugyō" and "Jinshin inga" fascicles, and is also discussed in 1.62 and 9.77, among other passages. The kōan concerns the relation between two views of casuality, one affirming and the other denying the role of karma:<sup>14</sup>

After relating the story of Pai-chang and the wild fox, [Dōgen] asked the great assembly: Because of the former Pai-chang's saying, "not falling into cause and effect," why was he transformed into a wild fox body? As to the current Pai-chang's saying, "not obscuring cause and effect," how did this cause the release from the wild fox body?

The teacher [Dōgen] himself said: Look at this wild fox spirit shaking his head and wagging his tail. Stop, stop!

No 3.195 makes iconoclastic or demythological remarks on the topic of supranormal powers that is also the subject of the "Jinzū" fascicle and is discussed in nos. 1.17, 2.196, and 9.27.

[Dōgen] said, An accomplished master must be endowed with the six spiritual powers. The first is the power over physical limitations; the second is the power to hear everything; the third is the power to know others' minds; the fourth is the power to know previous lives; the fifth is the power to see everywhere; and the sixth is the power to extinguish outflows [attachments].

Everyone, do you want to see the power to go anywhere? The teacher [Dōgen] raised his fist.

Do you want to see the power to know others' minds? [Dogen] let one of his legs hang down from his seat.

Do you want to see the power of hearing everywhere? [Dōgen] snapped his fingers once.

Do you want to see the power of knowing previous lives? [Dō-gen] raised his fly-whisk.

Do you want to see the power of seeing everywhere? [Dōgen] drew a circle in the air with his fly-whisk.

Do you want to see the power of extinguishing outflows? [Dōgen] drew a single horizontal line [the character for "one"] with his whisk and said, Although this is so, ultimately, six times six is thirtysix.

Other sermons deal with various general Buddhist doctrines, such as no. 4.310, which gives a concrete, down-to-earth, demythological interpretation of the notion of mindfulness:

[Dōgen] said, Our Buddha [Śakyamuni] said to his disciples, "There are four foundations of mindfulness on which people should depend. These four foundations of mindfulness refer to contemplating the body as impure; contemplating sensation as suffering; contemplating mind as impermanent; and contemplating phenomena as nonsubstantial."

Eihei also has four foundations of mindfulness: contemplating the body as a skin bag; contemplating sensation as eating bowls; contemplating mind as fences, walls, tiles, and pebbles; and contemplating phenomena as old man Zhang drinking wine, old man Li getting drunk.

Great assembly, are my four foundations of mindfulness the same or different from the ancient Buddha's four foundations of mindfulness? If you say they are the same, your eyebrows will fall out [from lying]. If you say they are different, you will lose your body and life.

The phrase about mind as fences, walls, tiles, and pebbles suggests the concrete manifestations of phenomenal reality, and the connection to Zhang and Li, also used in no. 1.32, alludes to a passage in the recorded sayings of Yün-men that refers to new year's festivities and implies interconnectedness and the perva-

siveness of the Dharma. Also, no. 4.307 uses deceptively simple white-andblack imagery to depict the state of nonduality:

After a pause [Dōgen] said: A white heron perches in a snowy nest; in sameness there is difference. A crow alights on a black horse; within difference there is sameness.

In the final sections of the Eihei koroku (vols. 5-7, ed. Gien), there are numerous passages that deal explicitly with doctrines that generally assert the doctrine of karmic causality or refute syncretic or assimilative tendencies in Zen Buddhism. These passages have a striking resonance and consistency with the outlook of the 12-fascicle Shobogenzo. For example, in nos. 5.381, 6.437, 7.485, and 7.517, among others, Dogen argues for a strict adherence of karma (inga) and moral retribution in the three moments of time (sanjigo). Also, in nos. 4.383 and 5.412 he criticizes the notion of the "unity of three teachings" (Buddhism, Confucianism, Taoism) (sankyō itchi); in 5.390 he dismisses syncretism; in 5.402 and 7.472 he refutes the "naturalism heresy" (jinen gedo) that equates or identifies the identification of absolute reality with all of or particular parts of nature, or advocates an anthropomorphic view; and in 6.447 and 7.509 he rejects spiritism (reichi). At the same time, in no. 7.491 he rejects the view of a distinctive, autonomous Zen sect (Zen-shū), and in 4.335 he criticizes the distinction between different approaches to the actualization of Zen enlightenment, including Tathagata Zen based on the sutras and Patriarchal Zen based on the special transmission outside words and letters:

*Tathāgata* Zen (*nyorai Zen*) and Patriarchal Zen (*sōshi Zen*) were not transmitted by the ancients, but only transmitted falsely in the Eastern Land (China). For several hundred years some have been clinging with delusion to this vain name. How pitiful is the inferior condition of this age of decline.

Through the *jōdō* sermons collected in *Eihei kōroku*, despite other kinds of variations and disputations, Dōgen asserts the priority of *zazen* practice, as in no. 3.191, which refers to a story from *Ching-te ch'uan-teng lu*, volume 15:

[Dōgen] said: I remember, a monk asked Tou-tsi [Ta-t'ung], "What are the causes and conditions of this single great matter?"

Tou-tsi said, "Minister Yin asked me to open the hall and give a sermon."

The teacher [Dōgen] said, If it had been Eihei, I would not have spoken like this. If someone asks me, "What are the causes and conditions of this single great matter?" I would just say to him, "In the early morning I eat gruel and at noon I eat rice. Feeling strong, I practice *zazen*; when tired I sleep." He also continually emphasizes the experience of casting off body-mind, as in nos. 18 and 4.318.

My late teacher [Ju-ching] instructed the assembly, "Practicing Zen with a teacher (*sanzen*) is dropping off body and mind."

Great assembly, do you want to understand thoroughly the meaning of this?

After a pause [Dōgen] said, Sitting upright and casting off body and mind, the ancestral teachers' nostrils are flowers of emptiness.

The two doctrines of *zazen* and casting off body-mind are presented as a single experience in no. 4.337:

Great assembly, do you want to hear the reality of just sitting, which is the Zen practice that is casting off of body and mind?

# Conclusions: The Rhetoric of Criticism

The *Eihei kōroku* is extremely important for understanding the history of Dōgen's approach to monasticism and Zen thought and is remarkably rich in literary and rhetorical devices. Throughout the *Eihei kōroku*, especially the *jōdō* sermons, Dōgen expresses great respect and admiration for Zen Buddhism as practiced in China, particularly a reverence for Ma-tsu's saying "sun-face, moon-face," as well as for Sōtō predecessors Hung-chih and Ju-ching, whose sayings are often quoted or cited or alluded to. Yet Dōgen also relishes his role as a critical commentator and revisionist of many of the leading Chinese masters, including the leading figures of his lineage. A common refrain in many of the sermons is, "Other patriarchs have said it this way, but Eihei says it this way."

In the first volume of *Eihei kōroku*, Dōgen shows a tendency to revise and rewrite and even reverse the sayings of Chinese masters, as in no. 1.10 on Tung-shan and others, and no. 1.12, in which Dōgen argues that his predecessors were only partially correct in their interpretation. No. 2.131 takes up a dialogue from the *Ching-te ch'uan-teng lu* that was also cited in the *Mana Shō-bōgenzō* (no. 2), in which Pai-chang contends with his disciple Huang-po, who he referred to as a tiger, and he concludes by saying "I thought you were that person [to continue the lineage]":

These two old men could only speak of a tiger's stripes, they could not speak of a person's stripes. Moreover, they could not speak of a tiger without stripes, a person without stripes, a phoenix without markings, or a dragon without markings.... The question is not complete, the answer is not complete. Dōgen goes on to gloss each line of the Pai-chang–Huang-po dialogue and suggest alternative renderings at every step. He is also especially critical of Chao-chou, as in nos. 1.140, 4.331, and 4.339, in addition to no. 2.154, in which he first appears to be defending the Chinese master in citing a passage from Chao-chou's recorded sayings against a critique by a disciple, but concludes by overturning Chao-chou's standpoint:

Consider this. A monk asked Chao-chou, "What is the path without mistakes?"

Chao-chou said, "Clarifying mind and seeing one's own nature is the path without mistakes."

Later someone said, "Chao-chou only expressed 80 or 90 percent. I am not like this. If someone asks, 'What is the path without mistakes?' I would tell him, 'The inner gate of every house extends to Chang'an [the capital, lit. "long peace"].'"

The teacher [Dogen] said: Although this was how it was said this is not worth considering. The ancient buddha Chao-chou's expression is correct. Do you want to know the clear mind of which Chao-chou spoke?

[Dogen] cleared his throat, then said, Just this is it.

Do you want to know about the seeing into one's own nature that Chao-chou mentioned?

[Dōgen] laughed, then said, Just this is it.

Although this is so, the ancient buddha Chao-chou's eyes could behold east and west, and his mind abided south and north. If someone asked Daibutsu, "What is the path without mistakes?" I would say to him, "You must not go anywhere else."

Suppose someone says to me, "Master, isn't this tuning the string by gluing the fret?" I would say to him, "Do you fully understand tuning the string by gluing the fret?"

The phrases about not going anywhere else and "gluing the fret" allude to concrete manifestations of phenomenal reality rather than conceptual abstractions that may impede an appropriation of enlightenment experience.

In no. 4.296 on the winter solstice in 1248, Dōgen cites Hung-chih, as he had on several other occasions, including nos. 135 and 206. Dōgen says, "'My measuring cup is full and the balance scale is level,' but in the marketplace I buy what is precious and sell it for a low price," thereby reversing the statement in Hung-chih's sermon, "Even if your measuring cup is full and the balance scale is level, in transactions I sell at a high price and buy when the price is low." Perhaps Dōgen is demonstrating a bodhisattva-like generosity or showing the nondual nature of all phenomena that only appear to have different values. Of course, Dōgen's mentor Ju-ching is not immune to this treatment, as in no. 3.194:

[Dōgen] said, I remember, a monk asked an ancient worthy, "Is there Buddha Dharma or not on a steep cliff in the deep mountains?"

The worthy responded, "A large rock is large; a small one is small."

My late teacher T'ien-t'ung [Ju-ching] said, "The question about the steep cliff in the deep mountains was answered in terms of large and small rocks. The cliff collapsed, the rocks split, and the empty sky filled with a noisy clamor."

The teacher [Dōgen] said, Although these two venerable masters said it this way, Eihei [Dōgen] has another utterance to convey. If someone were to ask, "Is there Buddha Dharma or not on a steep cliff in the deep mountains?" I would simply say to him, "The lifeless rocks nod their heads again and again. The empty sky vanishes completely. This is something that exists within the realm of the buddhas and patriarchs. What is this thing on a steep cliff in the deep mountains?"

 $\left[\text{D}\bar{\text{o}}\text{gen}\right]$  pounded his staff one time, and descended from his seat.

The phrase, "The lifeless rocks nod their heads again and again," is a reference to Tao-sheng, Kumārajiva's great disciple and early Chinese Buddhist scholar, who, based on a passage in the *Mahāparinirvāṇa Sūtra* that all beings can become buddha, went to the mountain and preached the Dharma to the rocks, which nodded in response.

Finally, in no. 2.179 Dōgen critiques five prominent figures, Śākyamuni and four Chinese masters, who respond to a statement of the Buddha in the *Śūrangama Sūtra*, chapter nine, as also cited and discussed with the same conclusion in *Shōbōgenzō* "Tenbōrin":

[Dōgen] said, The World-Honored One said, "When one person opens up reality and returns to the source, all space in the ten directions self-destructs."

Teacher Wu-tsu of Mount Fa-yen said, "When one person opens up reality and returns to the source, all space in the ten directions crashes together resounding everywhere."

Zen Master Yüan-wu of Mount Jia-shan said, "When one person opens up reality and returns to the source, in all space in the ten directions flowers are added on to brocade."

Teacher Fo-hsing Fa-t'ai said, "When one person opens up real-

ity and returns to the source, all space in the ten directions is nothing other than all space in the ten directions."

My late teacher T'ien-t'ung [Ju-ching] said, "Although the World-Honored One made the statement, 'When one person opens up reality and returns to the source, all space in the ten directions disappears,' this utterance cannot avoid becoming an extraordinary assessment. T'ien-t'ung is not like this. When one person opens up reality and returns to the source, a mendicant breaks his rice bowl."

The teacher [Dōgen] said, The previous five venerable teachers said it like this, but Eihei has a saying that is not like theirs. When one person opens up reality and returns to the source, all space in the ten directions opens up reality and returns to the source.

Frequently Dōgen defeats the tendency in Zen toward abstraction and aloofness with interpretations based on concrete phenomena, perhaps influenced by Japanese Tendai thought, while also stressing the role of continuing practice as a corrective to Tendai esoteric (*mikkyō*) and mixed or assimilative practices. In this instance, however, Wu-tsu, Yüan-wu, and Ju-ching each suggest a concretization, especially the latter's rice-bowl comment, so Dōgen adapts a different strategy by declaring a tautology based on another Tendai strategy of equalizing the microcosm and macrocosm.

#### NOTES

I. From the Kamakura period until the revival of Sōtō scholarship in the seventeenth century, both texts were largely ignored, although an abbreviated version of the *Eihei kōroku* known as the *Eihei goroku* received much attention. During and since the Tokugawa era, the *Shōbōgenzō* has been seen as Dōgen's magnum opus.

2. Dōgen may have written some of the sermons out first, as they reveal a subtle use of rhyme and rhythmic patterns. An interesting question is the extent to which Dōgen's disciples knew enough Chinese to be able to follow the sermons at the time of their delivery.

3. Kagamishima Genryū, ed., *Dōgen zenji zenshū*, vols. 3 and 4 (Tokyo: Shunjūsha, 1988). Also, Ōtani Teppū has edited editions of both the Monkaku and Manzan versions. In writing this paper, all translations are from the Monkaku edition in the Kagamishima edited volumes. I have also consulted the new English translation currently being prepared for Wisdom Publications (tentative publication date 2005) by Taigen Dan Leighton and Shohaku Okumura, and I greatly appreciate their showing me the manuscript draft.

4. See Ishii Shūdō, "*Eihei Ryaku Roku* kangae: Jūnikanbon *Shōbōgenzō* to Kanren shite," *Matsugaoka Bunko Kenkyū Nempō* 11 (1997): 73–128. The *Eihei goroku* contains about one-seventh of the material in the *Eihei kōroku*.

5. In the following list of the contents and dates of composition for the *Eihei kōroku*, the first seven volumes are collections of *jōdō* sermons from Kōshō-ji, Daibutsuji and Eihei-ji, and the last three volumes collect various kinds of lectures and poetry. 6. The notion of change in the late Dōgen is crucial to the theory of Critical Buddhism (*Hihan Bukkyō*). See Steven Heine, "Critical Buddhism and Dōgen's Shōbōgenzō: The Debate over the 75–Fascicle and 12–Fascicle Texts," in Jamie Hubbard and Paul L. Swanson, eds., *Pruning the Bodhi Tree: The Storm over Critical Buddhism* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1997), pp. 251–285.

7. Other examples include 1.65, 1.66, 1.67, 1.71, 1.75, 1.76, 1.81, 1.83, 1.85, 1.86, 1.87, 1.95, 1.103, 1.104, 1.108, 1.109, and 1.112–1.122.

8. See Yifa, *The Origins of Buddhist Monastic Codes in China* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2002).

9. According to Okumura and Leighton, " 'Studying walking to be like someone from Handan' is a reference to a story by Chuang-tzu in the chapter on 'Autumn Water.' In this story someone from the countryside went to the city of Handan and imitated the fashionable walking of the townspeople. But before he had succeeded in mastering their walking, he had forgotten his own country walking, and had to crawl home on his hands and knees; see Sam Hamill and J. P. Seaton, trans., *The Essential Chuang Tzu* (Boston: Shambhala, 1999), p. 92."

10. See also 1.48, 2.171, and 2.184.

11. For other comments on the role of giving sermons and related topics in introducing Zen monasticism to Japan, see also no. 2.128 on the first first evening discourse (*bansan*) in Japan; 2.138 on Dōgen's being the first to transmit the role of the chief cook (*tenzo*) to Japan; no. 3.244 in which Dōgen says, "I am expounding Zen discourse all over the country"; no. 4.319 on dedicating the monks' hall on Mount Kichijō in Echizen; no. 5.358 on Japanese "listening to the name of *jōdō* for the first time since I transmitted it"; no. 5.378 about Dōgen's delivery of sermons being "the most extraordinary thing"; no. 5.406 on ceremonies in Japan to celebrate birth of Śākyamuni Buddha, in which Dōgen says, "I, Eihei, imported [this ritual] twenty years ago and held it. It must be transmitted in the future."

12. Andō Yoshinori, *Chūsei Zenshū bunseki no kenkyū* (Tokyo: Kokusho kankōkai, 2000), pp. 144–164. See also Hata Eigyoku, *"Eihei Kōroku—sono sodoku to chūkai,"* Sanshō (1975–1977).

13. Dōgen also often cites non-Zen or pre-Zen writings, including Pali texts and Mahāyāna sutras, especially during this period.

14. See Steven Heine, Shifting Shape, Shaping Text: Philosophy and Folklore in the Fox Kōan (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999).